

**San Antonio Water System  
Minority- and Woman-Owned  
Business Enterprise  
Disparity Study  
Public Webinar**

---

**Colette Holt & Associates  
Auxiliary Marketing Services  
Mentor Documents and Consulting**

30 June 2020

# Disparity Study Team

---

## ■ Colette Holt & Associates

- Colette Holt, J.D. - Project Manager
  - Nationally recognized expert, educator and author on M/W/DBE issues
- Steven Pitts, Ph.D. - Economist and Statistician
  - Nationally recognized expert, educator and author on market issues regarding minorities for over 30 years
- Joanne Lubart, J.D. - Associate Counsel
  - National expert DBE programs
- Glenn Sullivan - Director of Technology
  - Extensive experience with CHA data collection and website management

# Disparity Study Team, cont.

---

- Ilene Grossman, B.A. - Assistant Project Manager/COO
  - Experienced manager of disparity studies
- Victoria Farrell, M.B.A. – Anecdotal Team Manager
  - Experienced researcher and data manager
- Carol Borst - Contract Data Collection Team Manager
  - Experienced coordinator of all contract data collection activities

# Disparity Study Team, cont.

---

- Local subconsultants
  - Will assist with community outreach and contract data and anecdotal data collection
  - Auxiliary Marketing Systems (SCTRCA) (HUB)
    - Specializes in public involvement, public relations, and marketing communications services. Has extensive knowledge of the San Antonio area business communities.
  - Mentor Documents and Consulting (SCTRCA) (HUB)
    - Specializes in data analytics, quality control/quality assurance, and data validation. Has vast experience in data collection, analytics, systems and procedures.

# Disparity Study Objectives

---

- Comply with constitutional mandate to regularly review evidence supporting race- and gender-based programs
- Provide a defense if the program is challenged
- Develop accurate data for annual and contract goal setting
- Gather feedback for program improvements
- Educate elected officials, SAWS staff, community groups and business owners on these issues

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Study website
  - Home page
  - Meet Our Team
  - Participate
  - Contact Us and Public Comment
- Legal Review
- SAWS' utilization of M/WBEs as a percentage of all dollars
  - Study period is FY 2017 to FY 2019
  - Step 1: Gather SAWS' prime contracts to create Contract Data File

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Step 2: Gather any additional data for contracts in the Contract Data File
- Step 3: Contact primes for missing subcontractor data, if necessary
  - Collect at least 80% of the contract dollars
  - Assign missing race and gender ownership status
  - Assign missing NAICS codes
- Step 4: Determine geographic and product markets
  - Determine the unconstrained product market
  - Analyze data for primes, subs and combined
  - Determine the geographic market for at least 75% of the contracts
  - Determine product market constrained by geographic market
  - Determine detailed utilization by race, gender and 6-digit NAICS codes

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Availability of M/W/BEs in SAWS' markets
  - Create Master List of M/WBEs from multiple entities
  - Develop list from the Contract Data File and other lists
  - Obtain Hoovers/Dun & Bradstreet for overall business universe
  - Assign missing race and gender status and NAICS codes
  - Estimate detailed, unweighted and weighted availability combined and disaggregated by race, gender and industry codes



# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Disparity analysis
  - Disparity ratio = M/WBE utilization ÷ weighted availability
    - 80% or less is substantive, supporting the inference of discrimination
    - Develop confidence intervals for statistical significance
  - Calculate disparity indices for:
    - All race and sex groups and all industry groups combined, and race and sex disaggregated

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Economy-wide disparity analyses
  - Compare M/WBEs' revenues to non-M/WBEs' using the Census Bureau's Survey of Business Owners
  - Compare M/WBEs' formation rates and business earnings to non-M/WBEs' using the Census Bureau's American Community Survey
  - Critical for evaluation of effectiveness of race- and gender-neutral measures

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Anecdotal data collection and analysis
  - Small group business owner interviews
    - M/WBEs and non-M/WBEs
    - Explore
      - Barriers to M/WBEs' success in SAWS area markets
      - Experiences with discrimination
      - Ability to access SAWS prime and subcontracts
      - Possible supportive services or other race- and gender-neutral measures
  - Electronic business owner survey
  - SAWS staff interviews

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- SMWVB Program Review
  - Review program documents
  - Solicit input and suggestions from stakeholders, business owners and SAWS staff
  - Topics will include:
    - Outreach to M/WBEs and small firms
    - Program elements
      - Certification standards and processes
      - Annual and contract goal setting
      - Evaluation of bids/proposals for program compliance
      - Contract monitoring, including commercially useful function evaluations and sub substitutions
    - Barriers to SAWS prime and subcontracts
    - Contract data collection and reporting processes

# Disparity Study Elements

---

- Recommendations
  - Race- and gender-neutral measures to reduce barriers and increase opportunities
  - Potential narrowly tailored race- and gender-conscious remedies
    - Program eligibility
    - Annual M/WBE goals
    - Contract goal setting methodology
    - Bid/proposal evaluation
    - Contract performance policies and processes
  - Monitoring and data collection

# Study Participation Information

---

- Business owner interviews October 2020
- Electronic survey of business owners November- December 2020
- Study information
  - <http://saws.disparity-study.com>
  - [saws-study@mwbelaw.com](mailto:saws-study@mwbelaw.com)
  - 855-692-3529 (855-MWBELAW)
- San Antonio Water System
  - Marisol V. Robles, SMWVB Program Manager, [marisol.robles@saws.org](mailto:marisol.robles@saws.org), 210-233-3420



---

16 Carriage Hills • San Antonio, Texas 78257

773.255.6844 • [colette.holt@mwbelaw.com](mailto:colette.holt@mwbelaw.com)

[www.mwbelaw.com](http://www.mwbelaw.com) • Twitter: [@mwbelaw](https://twitter.com/mwbelaw)